

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

HOLCOMBE, et. al,

Plaintiffs

vs.

UNITED STATES OF  
AMERICA,

Defendant

NO. 5:18-CV-00555-XR  
(consolidated cases)

**PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO THE GOVERNMENT'S  
MOTION TO RECONSIDER SANCTIONS**

Rule 26(g)(1) requires a party to ground its discovery responses in fact or law. *See Heller v. City of Dallas*, 303 F.R.D. 466, 476–77 (N.D. Tex. 2014). Because the Government botched the most basic discovery rule, sanctions were appropriate and continue to be appropriate to deter future wrongful conduct.

First, the Government's discovery responses were divorced from fact. For example, the Government took the position that a “substantial portion, if not most,” of the DODIG Report on the *Sutherland Springs shooting* was not relevant to this case. U.S. Mot. Protective Order, at 9 (ECF No. 124). And while the Government's Original Answers assert at least sixteen (16) Affirmative Defenses, the Government cannot identify a single witness to disclose under Rule 26. In the same way, the Government also refused to respond to Plaintiffs' interrogatory requesting the identity of individuals with knowledge. The Government knew—when it objected and refused to respond to this

interrogatory—that the Court would not “consider objections to these interrogatories, except upon a showing of exceptional circumstances.” W.D. Tex. Civ. R. CV-33(b)(1); *see Heller*, 303 F.R.D. at 477 (“at the time it was signed,” the request must be grounded in fact and law).

Second, the Government’s discovery obstruction had no good-faith legal basis nor exceptional circumstances to warrant its behavior. Here, the Government continues to assert that “concerns about reprisal” justified their obstruction and need for protection. U.S. Mot. Recon. 9 (Oct. 30, 2019) (ECF No. 155). But the Government forgets that it admitted on the record that it has not received any credible threats to the safety of these individuals. Hr’g Tr. 7:10–13 (Sept. 25, 2019). Importantly, broad “allegations of harm, unsubstantiated by specific examples or articulated reason” do not support a good cause showing for protection. *Glenmede Trust Co. v. Thompson*, 56 F.3d 476 (3d Cir. 1995) (cleaned up). And the Government never provided affidavits or **any evidence** to support its claim for protection. *See in re Terra Intern., Inc.*, 134 F.3d 302, 306 (5th Cir. 1998).

In sum, the Court’s reasonable, if not restrained, sanctions order was appropriate. Plaintiffs ask the Court to deny the Government’s invitation to relitigate these issues and deny its Motion for Reconsideration.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Jamal K. Alsaffar

**Jamal K. Alsaffar**

JAlsaffar@nationaltriallaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24027193

**Tom Jacob**

TJacob@nationaltriallaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24069981

**Whitehurst, Harkness, Brees, Cheng,**

**Alsaffar & Higginbotham & Jacob**

**PLLC**

7500 Rialto Blvd, Bldg. Two, Ste 250

Austin, TX 78735

Office 512-476-4346

Fax 512-476-4400

Counsel for Vidal, McKenzie, Solis,

McNulty, and Wall

/s/ Jason P. Steed

**Jason P. Steed**

JSteed@kilpatricktownsend.com

Texas Bar No. 24070671

**Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton**

**LLP**

2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 4400

Dallas, TX75201

Office 214-922-7112

Fax 214-853-5731

Counsel for Vidal, McNulty, and Wall

/s/ April A. Strahan

**April A. Strahan**

april@ammonslaw.com

Texas Bar No. 24056387

**Robert E. Ammons**

rob@ammonslaw.com

Texas Bar No. 01159820

**The Ammons Law Firm**

3700 Montrose Blvd.

Houston, TX 77006

Office 866-523-1603

Fax 713-523-4159

Counsel for Holcombe, Ramsey, Curnow

& Macias

/s/ Daniel J.T. Sciano

**Daniel J.T. Sciano**

DSciano@tsslawyers.com

Texas Bar No. 17881200

**Tinsman & Sciano**

10107 McAllister Freeway

San Antonio, TX 78216

Office 210-225-3121

Fax 210-225-6235

Counsel for Amador

/s/ Daniel Barks

**Daniel D. Barks, pro hac vice**

ddb@speiserkrause.com

**Speiser Krause, P.C.**

5555 Glenridge Connector, Suite 550

Atlanta, GA 30342

Office 571-814-3344

Fax 866-936-6382

Counsel for Holcombe

/s/ Mark Collmer

**Mark W. Collmer**

drcollmer@aol.com

Texas Bar No. 04626420

**Collmer Law Firm**

3700 Montrose

Houston, TX 77006

Office 713-337-4040

Counsel for Holcombe

/s/ Dennis Peery

**Dennis Charles Peery**  
d.peery@tylerpeery.com  
Texas Bar No. 15728750  
**R. Craig Bettis**  
cbettis@tylerpeery.com  
Texas Bar No. 24040518  
**Tyler & Peery**  
5822 West IH 10  
San Antonio, TX 78201  
Office 210-774-6445  
Counsel for Uhl

/s/ George LeGrand

**George LeGrand**  
tegrande@aol.com  
Texas Bar No. 12171450  
**Stanley Bernstein**  
Texas Bar No. 02225400  
**LeGrand & Bernstein**  
2511 N. Saint Mary's St.  
San Antonio, Texas 78212  
Office 210-733-9439  
Fax 510-735-3542  
Counsel for Wall & Solis

/s/ Justin Demerath

**Justin Demerath**  
jdemerath@808west.com  
Texas Bar No. 24034415  
**O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath**  
808 West Ave.  
Austin, TX 78701  
Office 512-494-9949  
Counsel for Corrigan, Braden,  
Warden, Stevens, Pachal, McCain, &  
Poston

/s/ Tim Maloney

**Tim Maloney**  
Texas Bar No. 12887380  
timmaloneyn@yahoo.com  
**Paul E. Campolo**  
pcampolo@maloneyandcampolo.com  
Texas Bar No. 03730150  
**Maloney & Campolo, L.L.P.**  
926 S. Alamo  
San Antonio, TX 78205  
Office (210) 465-1523  
Counsel for Ramsey

/s/ Joe Schreiber

**Joseph M. Schreiber**  
joe@lawdoneright.net  
Texas Bar No. 240374497  
**Erik A. Knockaert**  
erik@lawdoneright.net  
Texas Bar No. 24036921  
**Schreiber | Knockaert, PLLC**  
701 N. Post Oak Rd., Suite 325  
Houston, TX 77024  
Phone (281) 949-8904  
Fax (281) 949-8914  
Counsel for Brown

/s/ Jason Webster

**Jason Webster**  
jwebster@thewebsterlawfirm.com  
Texas Bar No. 24033318  
**The Webster Law Firm**  
6200 Savoy  
Suite 640  
Houston, TX 77036  
Counsel for Lookingbill

/s/ Brett Reynolds

**Brett T. Reynolds**

btreynolds@btrlaw.com

Texas Bar No. 16795500

**Brett Reynolds & Associates, P.C.**

1250 N.E. Loop 420, Suite 420

San Antonio, TX 78219

(210)805-9799

Counsel for Workman, Colbath, and  
Harris

/s/ Marco Crawford

**Marco Crawford**

**Law Office of Thomas J. Henry**

4715 Fredricksburg

San Antonio, TX 78229

(210) 585-2151

(361) 985-0601 (fax)

mcrawford@tjhlaw.com

Counsel for McMahan

/s/ Marion M. Reilly

Marion M. Reilly

**Hilliard Munoz Gonzales, L.L.P.**

719 S. Shoreline - Ste 500

Corpus Christi, TX 78401

(361) 882-1612

361/882-3015 (fax)

marion@hmglawfirm.com

Counsel for McMahan

/s/ Kelley W. Kelley

**Kelley W. Kelley**

**Anderson & Associates Law Firm**

2600 SW Military Drive, Suite 118

San Antonio, TX 78224

(210) 928-9999

(210) 928-9118 (fax)

kk.aalaw@yahoo.com

Counsel for Ward

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

By our signatures above, we certify that a copy of Plaintiffs' Response to the Government's Motion to Reconsider Sanctions has been sent to the following on October 31, 2019 via the Court's CM/ECF notice system.

**JOSEPH H. HUNT**  
Assistant Attorney General  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division

**JOHN F. BASH**  
United States Attorney  
Western District of Texas

**KIRSTEN WILKERSON**  
Assistant Director, Torts Branch  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division

**PAUL DAVID STERN**  
Trial Attorney, Torts Branch  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division  
**CLAYTON R. DIEDRICH**  
Assistant United States Attorney

**JIM F. GILLIGAN**  
Assistant United States Attorney

**JOHN PANISZCZYN**  
Civil Chief  
United States Attorney's Office  
Western District of Texas

**JAMES G. TOUHEY, JR.**  
Director, Torts Branch  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division

**STEPHEN E. HANDLER**  
Senior Trial Counsel, Torts Branch  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division

**STEPHEN TERRELL**  
Trial Attorney, Torts Branch  
United States Dept. of Justice  
Civil Division  
**JAMES E. DINGIVAN**  
Assistant United States Attorney